PCCP





Cite this: Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2016, 18, 5219

Received 29th October 2015, Accepted 18th January 2016

DOI: 10.1039/c5cp06603d

www.rsc.org/pccp

Enhancing the carrier thermalization time in organometallic perovskites by halide mixing*

Mohamed El-Amine Madjet,*^a Alexey V. Akimov,*^b Fadwa El-Mellouhi,^a Golibjon R. Berdiyorov,^a Sahel Ashhab,^a Nouar Tabet^a and Sabre Kais^{ac}

Hybrid metal-organic halide perovskites have recently attracted a great deal of attention because of their interesting electronic, optical and transport properties, which make them promising materials for high-performance, low-cost solar cells. Fundamental understanding of the formation mechanisms and dynamics of photoinduced charge carriers is essential for improving the performance of perovskite solar cell devices. For example, a significant amount of absorbed solar energy is lost as a result of carrier thermalization. This energy could be harnessed by extracting hot carriers before they cool down to the band edges. Although such hot carrier collection is experimentally challenging, theoretical investigations based on time-dependent methods can guide future experimental research by providing insights into the thermalization process. Here, we perform *ab initio* nonadiabatic molecular dynamics simulations to study non-radiative relaxation dynamics of charge carriers in hybrid halide perovskites. We find that the carrier relaxation time can be considerably increased by mixing halogen atoms in the perovskite materials. These findings show that simple approaches could be adopted to slow down the thermalization process of hot carriers in perovskite materials.

Hybrid metal-organic halide perovskites (HMOHPs), such as methylammonium (MA) lead iodide (CH₃NH₃PbI₃ or MAPbI₃), have received a revival of interest in recent years as promising materials for solar energy applications. Their remarkable optical properties also make them very promising for use in light emitting devices, such as lasers.¹ Solar power conversion efficiencies of more than 20% reported for these materials² (see ref. 3-9 for reviews) qualify them as a promising potential alternative to silicon in the photovoltaics industry. Moreover, lead halide perovskite solar cells can be fabricated using lowtemperature solution processing and inkjet printing methods that would result in a low manufacturing cost. The high photovoltaic efficiency in this class of materials is mainly related to strong light absorption across much of the solar spectrum,¹⁰⁻¹⁴ the relatively long diffusion lengths of charge carriers^{15–19} and the high carrier mobility²⁰⁻²⁵ associated with a low sensitivity to defects.^{26,27} In addition, the structural and electronic properties of MAPbI₃ have been improved by chemical engineering, e.g., through mixing halogen atoms.^{19,28-38} Halogen mixing is believed to improve the stability of the material^{30,39} and prevent the formation of key structural defects.⁴⁰ Improved chargecarrier mobility and electron and hole diffusion lengths have also been observed in mixed-halide perovskites.^{15,16,28,41-43}

CHEMISTRY

View Article Online

For the various projected applications of HMOHPs, a thorough experimental and theoretical understanding of the processes leading to charge carrier formation, charge density dynamics, band filling, defect migration as well as spectral broadening mechanisms, is essential.44-48 Recently, Miyata et al.50 determined from experimental results that the exciton binding energy for the orthorhombic phase of MAPbI₃ is 16 meV. They also showed that for the tetragonal phase the binding energy is on the order of only a few millielectron volts. In fact, the presence of photo-induced free carriers has been confirmed in these materials,16,49 pointing to weak Coulomb interactions between electrons and holes. These findings validate the previously proposed hypothesis of spontaneous free carrier generation following light absorption by perovskite materials at room temperature. However, many fundamental processes related to the photophysics, such as the properties of photo-excited electrons, remain nearly unexplored. In this context, a theoretical investigation based on timedependent methods is needed to understand in more detail recent experimental findings⁵¹ and also to guide future experimental investigations.

In photovoltaic cells, the photoexcitation of electrons from the valence band to the conduction band generally results in the formation of hot electrons and holes. These carriers lose

^a Qatar Environment and Energy Research Institute, Hamad Bin Khalifa University, Qatar Foundation, PO Box 5825, Doha, Qatar. E-mail: mmadjet@qf.org.qa

^b Department of Chemistry, University at Buffalo, Buffalo, State University of

New York, NY 14260-3000, USA. E-mail: alexeyak@buffalo.edu

^c Department of Chemistry, Physics and Birck Nanotechnology Center,

Purdue University, West Lafayette, IN 47907, USA

[†] Electronic supplementary information (ESI) available. See DOI: 10.1039/ c5cp06603d

Paper

their kinetic energy by cooling down to the band edges. This thermalization process occurs on a femtosecond timescale. The carrier recombination process in these direct-gap materials is dominated by the electron-hole radiative recombination and occurs on a time scale that is typically longer than a nanosecond, meaning that the recombination process can be ignored at the timescale of relaxation dynamics. Ideally, and for efficient device operation, extracting photogenerated charge carriers with minimal energy and carrier losses is desirable. However, the slowing down of hot carrier relaxation dynamics due to halogen-mixing will probably have negligible effects on charge separation. We would like to point out that a full analysis of the charge separation mechanism is beyond the scope of the present work.

Harvesting the energy of hot carriers before it is converted into heat would enhance the power conversion efficiency $(PCE)^{52}$ of a solar cell through an increase in the carrier collection efficiency and the open circuit voltage (V_{oc}). Finding ways to increase the carrier lifetime would also provide a path to control the relaxation dynamics, which would be favourable for photovoltaic applications. Various approaches have been suggested in the literature, including the use of quantum dots to slow down the thermalization process⁵³ or erbium ions in combination with silicon nanocrystals to generate infrared photons.⁵⁴ However the successful implementation of these ideas in a working device remains a challenge. In a recent experiment, Yang et al.55 found that thermalization in perovskites can slow down by about three orders of magnitude due to a hot-phonon bottleneck at high injection levels. A slow cooling dynamics and a phonon bottleneck effect were also resolved by Price et al.⁵⁶ They observed that at higher excitation densities, a phonon bottleneck effect becomes more pronounced that substantially slows hot carrier cooling. Consequently, due to the practical and fundamental importance of electron and hole relaxation dynamics in photovoltaic materials in general and in perovskites in particular, it is crucial to understand how this process depends on the perovskite structure and what are the timescales for these processes, which might provide guidance for the better design of hot-carrier device architecture.

Recently, there have been a number of experimental and theoretical studies performed in order to gain insight into the carrier transport and hot carrier relaxation processes in organic-inorganic perovskite materials.15,51,57-66 Using femtosecond transient absorption spectroscopy, Manser and Kamat⁶⁶ reported the characterisation of the ultrafast relaxation processes and charge accumulation in MAPbI3 due to the thermalization of hot carriers that start filling the states near the band edges. This results in an increase of the band gap, and more energetic photons are required to generate additional charge carriers. Sum and Mathews⁵ reviewed the basic working mechanisms of perovskite solar cells linked to their fundamental photophysics and intrinsic properties. The radiative recombination of free carriers occurs over a period of several nanoseconds by emitting strong and broad photoluminescence (PL) spectra around the band gap energy. Recent experiments have shown that the Cl-doped

 $\rm MAPbI_3$ perovskite has a long PL lifetime of a few hundred nanoseconds. However the direct effect of the Cl^- ions is still a matter of debate.

In the present study, we will investigate the effect of halide mixing on carrier relaxation dynamics. We use non-adiabatic molecular dynamics (NA-MD) combined with time-dependent Kohn–Sham (TD-KS) density functional theory to study the non-radiative electron and hole relaxation dynamics in lead-halide perovskites $CH_3NH_3PbX_3$ (X = I, Cl, Br) and show how the relaxation time depends on the structure and composition of the system. Since the charge carrier relaxation is driven by inelastic electron–phonon scattering,⁴⁴ we also discuss the vibrational modes that drive the relaxation of hot electrons and holes to the band edges. Our findings show that simple approaches could be adopted to slow down the thermalization process of hot carriers based on careful tailoring of the composition and structure of the absorbing layers such as using mixed-halide materials.

1 Computational methodology

Our approach for studying excited state dynamics is based on Kohn-Sham density-functional theory (KS-DFT) which provides a good description of the non-adiabatic dynamics of extended systems while remaining computationally tractable. It is known that the GW approximation is the most rigorous approach for studying the excited state properties of periodic systems including many-electron effects. Including the effect of spin-orbit coupling would also allow a more accurate description of the electronic, optical and transport properties of organic-inorganic perovskite materials.⁶⁷ However, for long molecular transitions simulations involving excited states and nonadiabatic dynamics, using GW and including spin-orbit coupling becomes computationally demanding. The KS-DFT based method offers an alternative computational framework making it possible to propagate the nonadiabatic molecular dynamics of extended systems at an affordable computational cost and providing a qualitatively good description of the dynamics.

In the following we give a brief description of the nonadiabatic molecular dynamics formalism used in the present study. We use a mixed quantum-classical trajectory surface hopping (TSH) approach,⁶⁸ which represents one of the most promising and computationally feasible methods for extended systems. In this approach, the electrons are described quantum mechanically by solving the Schrödinger equation and the nuclei are treated classically by solving the classical Newton equations. The integration of the classical equations is done by using the velocity Verlet algorithm.^{69,70} Since both electrons and holes are described quantum mechanically, this approximation is appropriate to study charge carrier transport properties. The electronic wave function can be expressed in terms of the adiabatic states $\Phi_t(\vec{r}; \vec{R}(t))$ by the following expression

$$\Psi(\vec{r},\vec{R},t) = \sum_{i} c_i(t) \Phi_i(\vec{r};\vec{R}(t)), \qquad (1)$$

where \vec{r} and \vec{R} denote collective electronic and nuclear coordinates, respectively. The expansion coefficients $c_i(t)$ are determined by propagating the time-dependent Schrödinger equation

$$i\hbar \frac{\mathrm{d}c_i(t)}{\mathrm{d}t} = \sum_j c_j(t) \Big[H_{ij} - i\hbar \dot{\vec{R}} \cdot \vec{d}_{ij} \Big], \tag{2}$$

where \vec{d}_{ij} are the derivative coupling matrix elements between states *i* and *j*. The TSH scheme requires the computation of the nonadiabatic electronic coupling (NAC) between the KS orbitals driven by the ionic motion as

$$\sigma_{ij} = \dot{\vec{R}} \cdot \vec{d}_{ij} = \dot{\vec{R}} \cdot \left\langle \Phi_i(\vec{r}; \vec{R}(t)) \middle| \vec{\nabla}_{\vec{R}} \middle| \Phi_j(\vec{r}; \vec{R}(t)) \right\rangle.$$
(3)

In the adiabatic representation the Hamiltonian matrix H_{ij} is diagonal and eqn (2) simplifies to

$$i\hbar \frac{\mathrm{d}c_i(t)}{\mathrm{d}t} = c_i(t)\varepsilon_i - i\hbar \sum_j c_j \sigma_{ij},\tag{4}$$

where ε_i is the energy of the *i*th KS orbital. For the evaluation of the NAC term, we use the finite difference scheme proposed by Hammes-Schiffer and Tully,⁷¹ where σ_{ij} is expressed in terms of the overlap between the wave functions at *t* and *t* + d*t*

$$\sigma_{ij}(t+dt/2) = \frac{1}{2dt} \Big[\Big\langle \Phi_i(\vec{r};\vec{R}(t)) \big| \Phi_j(\vec{r};\vec{R}(t+dt)) \Big\rangle - \Big\langle \Phi_i(\vec{r};\vec{R}(t+dt)) \big| \Phi_j(\vec{r};\vec{R}(t)) \Big\rangle \Big]$$
(5)

Note that the NAC between the states i and j is evaluated at every time step of the molecular dynamics (MD) trajectory. The transition dipole moments can be computed using the following relation:

$$\vec{\mu}_{ij} \equiv e \langle \Phi_i | \vec{r} | \Phi_j \rangle \tag{6}$$

In the surface hopping formalism, the photo-excited electron is assumed to be in one of the adiabatic KS state at any point in time *t*, but it has the possibility of stochastically hopping from one state to another. The hopping probability from state *i* to *j* is given by⁶⁸

$$P_{i \to j} = 2 \int_{t}^{t+dt} \mathrm{d}\tau \frac{\mathrm{Re}[c_i(\tau)^* c_j(\tau) \sigma_{ij}(\tau)]}{c_i(\tau) c_i^*(\tau)},\tag{7}$$

where dt and $d\tau$ are the electronic and nuclear integration time steps, respectively. In order to calculate the hopping probability $P_{i \rightarrow j}$, the coefficients c_i are obtained by the numerical integration of the differential eqn (4). Note that the population of state i is given by $|c_i|^2$. It is worth mentioning that the quantities $P_{i \rightarrow j}$ only determine the state of the system with respect to possible hops. If the quantity $P_{i \rightarrow j}$ is negative, no hops from state i to state j are possible. In this case, the hopping probability is set to zero. If the quantity $P_{i \rightarrow j}$ is positive, more population must be transferred to state j, which can be accommodated *via* a surface hop. In this case the quantity is associated with the hopping probability. Therefore, the final transition probability is defined as

$$g_{ij} = \max(P_{i \to j}, 0). \tag{8}$$

The relaxation dynamics is computed using the fewest-switches surface-hopping (FSSH)⁶⁸ technique adapted to the classical path approximation (CPA), as explained elsewhere.^{73,74} The FSSH probabilities are related to the flux of state populations, rather than the state populations themselves. This property minimizes the number of hops, giving rise to the term "fewest switches". A random number ξ is generated ($0 \le \xi \le 1$) at each time step and a hop from state *i* to state *k* is performed if

$$\sum_{j=1}^{k} g_{ij} < \xi < \sum_{j=1}^{k+1} g_{ij}.$$
 (9)

In the original FSSH formulation, after a hop to a new state, the nuclear velocities are rescaled along the NAC coupling direction to conserve the total energy. In the present FSSH-CPA, no such velocity rescaling is needed. Instead, it is replaced by scaling the transition probabilities by a Boltzmann factor (see ref. 74). More details about the NA-MD methodology can be found in ref. 72 and 75. Note that electron-hole interactions are not included in our approach. However, knowing that the exciton binding energy in hybrid perovskites is only a few meV⁵⁰ (due to the large value of the real part of the static dielectric constant), one can expect that exciton effects on the thermalization process of hot carriers will be small. To study hot electron and hole relaxation processes in the lead halide perovskites, we perform nonadiabatic molecular dynamics simulations using a combination of the PYthon eXtension for the Ab Initio Dynamics (PYXAID)^{73,74} package for quantum dynamics simulations interfaced with the Quantum Espresso (QE) electronic structure code. Quantum calculations employ DFT using the PBE exchange-correlation functional^{76,77} as implemented in the QE package.⁷⁸ Following the standard procedure, the effects of the core electrons are described by atomic pseudopotentials generated independently for all atoms included in the calculations. Norm-conserving pseudopotentials are used to describe the core-valence interaction. The valence electrons are described using plane waves and cutoffs of 50 Ry and 530 Ry for the wavefunctions and the density expansion, respectively.

The computations are performed in three steps, as described elsewhere.^{73,74} In the first step, a full optimization of the cell volume and atomic positions of the perovskite ground state structures are performed until energy and forces have converged to variations smaller than 10^{-4} eV and 0.01 eV Å⁻¹, respectively. Subsequently, the system is thermalized by running an ab initio MD simulation of up to 7 ps within the canonical NVT ensemble. The velocity Verlet⁶⁹ algorithm with a time step of 1 fs is utilized to propagate the nuclear coordinates, and the electronic amplitude is propagated with a time step of 0.1 fs. The Andersen (collision) thermostat⁷⁹ is used to maintain the average temperature at 300 K, and a collision frequency parameter of 0.05 fs^{-1} is used. In the second step of our computations, the electronic structure of the evolving system is recomputed for each time step along the MD trajectory. The computed KS energies and orbitals are utilized to obtain the nonadiabatic (NA) couplings using eqn (5) and to form the vibronic Hamiltonian matrices as well as to compute the transition dipole matrix elements from eqn (6).

Paper

This time-dependent information is stored and used to perform the subsequent NA-MD simulations and data analysis. According to the CPA employed in the present study, the evolution of electronic degrees of freedom follows the ground-state evolution of the nuclei, but the nuclear dynamics remains unaffected by the electronic transitions. This approximation is justified by a relatively rigid structure of the perovskite materials and by the absence of significant structural changes upon photoexcitation. We consider perovskites in the tetragonal room temperature phase where the valence band maximum and the conduction band minimum are located at the Γ point. Also only the Γ point of the Brillouin zone is used in the excited state dynamics. In the third step of our computations, the NA-MD simulations are performed. To study the hot hole and hot electron relaxation processes, we have chosen a minimal basis of adiabatic excited states represented by excited Slater determinants constructed from the KS orbitals.⁸⁰ In the present approach, the timedependent electron wave function of the system is not based on a many-body all-electron wave function but relies on singleparticle orbitals. Future studies going beyond the single-particle approximation by including the electron-electron interactions will be useful to investigate the quasiparticle effects on the relaxation of hot carriers. The last approximation was already used in a previous theoretical work to investigate the relaxation of hot carriers in silicon.⁸¹ To obtain reliable statistics, we average the results over 1000 stochastic realizations of the surface hopping procedure and over 20 starting geometries. To avoid numerical artifacts associated with incomplete thermalization, we exclude the first 1 ps of the computed MD trajectory from our sampling domain. To understand the charge transfer and energy relaxation dynamics, we compute the average populations of several excited electronic and hole states. The timedependent population of each state can be calculated by

$$\operatorname{Pop}_{i}^{\mathrm{SH}}(t) = \frac{N_{i}(t)}{N}$$
(10)

where $N_i(t)$ is the number of SH trajectories in electronic state *i* at time *t* and *N* is the total number of trajectories within the ensemble. The average value of energy of a carrier (electron or hole) can be computed as a function of time as

$$E(t) = \left\langle \sum_{i} E_{i} \operatorname{Pop}_{i}^{\mathrm{SH}}(t) \right\rangle_{\mathrm{ens}}$$
(11)

where $E_i(t)$ denotes the energy of the basis set *i* and $\langle \cdot \rangle_{\text{ens}}$ is the ensemble average (over initial configurations and realizations of the surface hopping trajectories).

2 Results and discussion

As a typical example, we consider a unit cell of the tetragonal phase of MAPbI₃, which is the room temperature phase of the material. After optimization, we systematically replaced the iodide atoms with chlorine or bromine atoms at both the axial and the equatorial octahedral positions and relaxed the system further to its lowest-energy configuration. As an example, we

Table 1 Calculated lattice parameters (Å) for different perovskite systems

	MAPbI ₃	MAPbCl ₃	MAPbBr ₃	T-MAPbI ₃ (Cl)	T-MAPbI ₃ (Br)
a	8.98	8.12	8.65	8.80	8.83
С	12.94	11.36	12.77	12.86	12.89

present results for single Cl and Br substituted systems (which corresponds to 8% doping) at the equatorial site. The choice of equatorial site substitution was motivated by the fact that it is energetically more favorable (according to our total energy calculations) and is convenient because of the recent finding of Zheng *et al.*⁴³ that equatorial halide substitution results in enhanced transport properties of the material. Further investigations are needed to study the effect of the doping site and also the effect of the concentration on hot carrier thermalization. The systems will be referred to as T-MAPbI₃, T-MAPbI₃(Cl) T-MAPbI₃(Br) where the letter T refers to the tetragonal phase and the symbol between parentheses refers to the species substituting one iodine atom in the unit cell.

The structural properties of the fully relaxed systems are given in Table 1 to demonstrate the structural changes induced by halide mixing. It is worth noting that geometry optimization was done using a dense mesh of *k*-points ($8 \times 8 \times 8$). The calculated lattice parameters for MAPbI₃ were *a* = 8.98 Å and *c* = 12.94 Å which are comparable to the experimental results (*a* = 8.86 Å and *c* = 12.66 Å).⁸² Full iodine substitution leads to smaller lattice parameters in the three directions and one iodine substitution leads to a smaller *a* parameter (see Table 1). The optimized lattice parameters for T-MAPbI₃(Cl) and T-MAPbI₃(Br) are very similar.

2.1 Energy relaxation

We start our analysis by considering the relaxation of the ensemble-averaged excited state energy (eqn (11)) after the system is excited by a photon with energy larger than the band gap of the material. To study the energy relaxation of hot electrons and hot holes separately, we either excited electrons from the valence band maximum (VBM) to states in the conduction band with energy $\Delta E_{\rm e}$ above the conduction band minimum (CBM) or promoted electrons from states with energy $\Delta E_{\rm h}$ below the VBM to the CBM (see Fig. 1 for the definitions of $\Delta E_{\rm e}$ and $\Delta E_{\rm h}$). The energy values of $\Delta E_{\rm e}$ ($\Delta E_{\rm h}$) for CBM + n (VBM - n) are listed in Table S3 (ESI⁺). We should mention here that these values are not for the optimized structures but for structures used as initial structures for the nonadiabatic dynamics as the first 1 ps of the computed MD trajectory was excluded. The non-radiative relaxation occurs via the conversion of excitation energy to thermal energy driven by electronphonon interactions, as illustrated in Fig. 1. The relaxation process is described using the NA-MD in combination with Tully's surface hopping method.⁶⁸ The time-dependent population is obtained by averaging over 20 initial configurations and 1000 surface hopping (SH) trajectories for each configuration. Non-adiabatic transitions starting from the six and ten lowest excited states were included in electron and hole relaxation dynamics, respectively.



Fig. 1 Upper panel: Optimized geometries of MAPbI₃ (a) and chloridedoped MAPbI₃(Cl) (b). Lower panel: Schematic diagram representing hot electron and hot hole relaxation dynamics in perovskite materials.

Fig. 2 presents the time evolution of the KS populationweighted energies (average excitation energies) in MAPbI₃ when the system is initially excited to different states with ΔE less than 0.5 eV above the CBM (Fig. 2a) and below the VBM (Fig. 2b) for hot electrons and hot holes, respectively. The most profound feature in the relaxation processes observed in the system is that, once excited to higher energy states, the average excitation energy for electrons clearly relaxes with a slower rate as compared to holes. The hole energies are nearly at zero after 1 ps, indicating that almost all holes have decayed to the VBM. The population-weighted energy of electrons, on the other hand, exhibits a much slower decay. For example, the CBM + 5 state ($\Delta E = 0.6141$ eV) is not fully relaxed even after 2500 fs (Fig. 2a). This difference in the non-radiative relaxation dynamics of hot electrons and hot holes can originate from the difference between the DOSs for electrons and holes⁹⁰ and different nonadiabatic coupling between the states in the conduction and valence bands. In the next section we will study the NAC between different states both in the conduction and valence bands.

2.2 Nonadiabatic couplings

To understand the different relaxation processes of electrons and holes, we have calculated nonadiabatic couplings between the energy states both in the valence and conduction bands.



VBM-4

VBM-5

VBM-6 VBM-7 VBM-8 VBM-9

1.5

2

2.5

0.8

0.6

0.4

0.2

0

0.8

0.6

0.4

0.2

0

n

0.5

Energy [eV]

Energy [eV]

Fig. 2 Time evolution of the KS population-weighted energies after initial excitations to different excited states for electrons (a) and holes (b) in $MAPbI_{3}$.

time [ps]

Fig. 3 shows the results for MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃(Cl), which are averaged over 5 ps MD trajectories. The transitions along the subdiagonal lines are strong, indicating that non-radiative transitions are most likely to occur between adjacent states. In contrast, the nonadiabatic coupling is very small between states that are separated by a large energy spacing. This behavior is expected, knowing that the strength of the NA coupling is inversely proportional to the difference between the energy levels. Tables S1 and S2 in the ESI[†] show the couplings between some states in the conduction and valence bands for MAPbI₃ and MAPbI₃(Cl), respectively. Clearly, the strongest coupling occurs between adjacent states in both the bands. As a general trend, for all the considered systems, the coupling between hole states is larger than that between electronic states. We should mention here that the NA coupling between valence states close to the VBM is weaker than the coupling between the states deep inside the valence band (see Fig. 3). For example, in the case of the MAPbI₃ system, the couplings between VBM/VBM - 1 and between VBM - 1/VBM - 2 states are 8.7 and 12.5 meV, respectively. Whereas the couplings between VBM - 6/VBM -7 and between VBM - 7/VBM - 8 states are 25.9 and 22.9 meV, respectively. This of course will have an impact on slowing down the hole relaxation when it is close to the VBM. The same

PCCP



Fig. 3 Visualization of the average magnitude of the nonadiabatic couplings (in units of meV) between states in the space of KS orbital indices for T-MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃ (CI). Here i = 0 means the VBM state, i = 1 means the CBM state, and other states are assigned indices based on these two reference points.

trend is also seen for NA couplings for $MAPbI_3(Cl)$. However, halide mixing results in a significant reduction of the nonadiabatic coupling between different states. This in turn increases the non-radiative relaxation time of the charge carriers, which we will discuss in the next section and show how the NA coupling controls hot carrier relaxation.

2.3 Electronic population decay

Fig. 4 shows the time dependence of the electronic population for all three systems, when the system is excited to the CBM + 4 state. Note that, for the sake of better illustration, we present the sum of the two lowest state populations (*i.e.* CBM and CBM + 1) as a new lowest state population (CBM01). For the full iodide system (Fig. 4a), it takes about 1 ps for the depopulation of the initial state and full population of the new lowest state. This population transfer occurs through a sequence of nonadiabatic transitions between neighbouring excited states before being transferred to the lowest excited states (CBM). The pathway for this sequential decay is determined by the strong nonadiabatic coupling between the excited states discussed in the previous section. However, direct population transfer between the initial state and the lower excited states is also possible because of the non-vanishing NA coupling between these two states.



Fig. 4 Time evolution of the electronic state populations after initial excitation to the excited state CBM + 4 for T-MAPbI₃ (a), T-MAPbI₃(Cl)(b), and T-MAPbI₃(Br) (c).

This indicates that the mechanism of carrier relaxation goes beyond the sequential stepwise fashion and may include several relaxation channels activated in parallel.

The situation changes considerably with the introduction of a single Cl substituent into the system (Fig. 4(b)). The time for both depopulation of the initial state and the full population of the lowest state increases by more than a factor of 2. This is due to the decreased coupling between the electronic states discussed earlier (see Fig. 3). However, the Br substituted system T-MAPbI₃(Br) does not show such a suppressed decay in the CBM + 4 carrier population (Fig. 4(c)) and remains comparable to T-MAPbI₃. The main difference is the population of the CBM + 3 state that overtakes the other populations at about 0.5 ps before it decays completely at about 2 ps. Similar results have been observed when the system is initially excited to the other states.

The time evolution of the hole state populations is shown in Fig. 5 when all the systems are initially excited to the VBM - 8 state. For MAPbI₃, this initial state corresponds to an energy of about 0.51 eV below the VBM. As we can see from the three

panels in the figure, an ultrafast decay is observed for the hole population in the three systems. The initial state is completely depopulated within 0.5 ps, which represents a faster decay process than the decay of the electron population (see Fig. 4). The simultaneous increase in the populations of multiple intermediate states is an indication that several relaxation channels contribute to the relaxation process. After 1.5 ps, the initial hole population is almost completely transferred to the edge of the valence band for all three systems.

To get an estimation of the relaxation time, the electron and hole initial-state depopulation is fitted by an exponential decay function $\exp(-t/\tau)$, where τ is the relaxation time. We also fitted the time-dependent populations of the two lowest states CBM01 by the function $1 - \exp(-t/\tau')$. As an example, we show in Fig. 6 the population time τ' of the lowest electron and hole states (CBM01 and VBM01) as a function of excited state energy ΔE for T-MAPbI₃ (open and filled circles) and T-MAPbI₃(Cl) (open and filled squares). For the other considered systems see Fig. S1 (ESI[†]). Note that in these figures we plotted the hot



Fig. 5 Time evolution of the hole state populations when initially starting from the excited state VBM - 8 for T-MAPbI₃ (a), T-MAPbI₃(Cl) (b), and T-MAPbI₃(Br) (c).



Fig. 6 Population time τ' (fs) of the lowest two electronic states (Pop(CBM01) = Pop(CBM) + Pop(CBM + 1)) when initially populating different electron/hole excited states and for two perovskite systems.

carrier relaxation time as a function of excitation energy rather than in terms of the excited state number. This is because the considered systems have different band structures and different absorption spectra. It can be seen from this figure that the hot electron (with $\Delta E < 0.5$ eV) relaxation in MAPbI₃ perovskites occurs between 350 fs and 850 fs, which is in good agreement with the findings of the recent experiments.⁵¹ The hot-hole relaxation time is smaller as compared to the hot-electron relaxation time, except for very small excitation energies. The difference between those two population times becomes more pronounced at larger excitation energies. For T-MAPbI₃ and for energies smaller than 0.3 eV, the population time for electrons and holes is very similar. For $\Delta E \approx 0.46$ eV, ${\tau_e}'\approx 700~\text{fs}$ compared to ${\tau_h}'\approx 600~\text{fs}.$ However, at an excitation energy close to 0.62 eV, the population time for electrons is about 1300 fs compared to 650 fs for holes. Cl substitution results in a significant increase in the relaxation time of hot electrons (see filled squares in Fig. 6). For example, at $E \approx 0.34$ eV, the electronic population is transferred to the conduction band edge of T-MAPbI₃ within 650 fs, whereas the population time of the lowest state in the Cl-substituted system is more than 1 ps. The depopulation times of the excited states are also increased by Cl substitution. For example, at $\Delta E =$ 0.32 eV the electrons in the full iodide system relax within ~400 fs, whereas for the T-MAPbI₃(Cl) system it increases to about 980 fs (see Fig. S1(a) and (e), ESI[†]). However, the effect of Cl substitution on the relaxation time of the hot holes is not as pronounced as in the case of the hot electrons: a small increase in the carrier relaxation time is obtained only at larger excitation energies (compare open circles and open squares in Fig. 6). A pronounced asymmetry in electron and hole relaxation dynamics is seen in the case of Cl substitution. As an example, for an excitation energy of 0.5 eV, $\tau_{e}' \approx$ 1160 fs compared to $\tau_{\rm h}' \approx 700$ fs. At an energy $\Delta E \approx 0.89$ eV, the population time for electrons is about 2290 fs which is more than 2.5 times larger than the population time for holes ($\tau_{\rm h}' \approx 840$ fs). We also found that the effect of partial Br substitution on the relaxation time

Paper

of the charge carriers is not as pronounced as in the case of partial Cl substitution (see Fig. S1(d) and (i), ESI[†]): only a small overall increase of the relaxation time is obtained. For comparison, we have also considered full Cl and Br substitution (see Fig. S1, ESI[†]). Despite a considerable increase in the charge carrier relaxation in the partially chlorinated system, full chlorination hinders this effect, with characteristic decay times comparable to or sometimes lower than the full iodine perovskite. In fact, the hot electron relaxation becomes faster in the T-MAPbCl₃ system as compared to the full iodide system for most of the excitation energies (Fig. S1(c) and (h), ESI⁺). Full bromination (T-MAPbBr₃) also results in a small overall increase of the relaxation time. For all the considered systems, the hole relaxation time shows a less pronounced energy dependence compared to the electron relaxation time. This could be due to the denser hole states, which result in stronger NA couplings and therefore more delocalized hole character.

In order to have a better representation of the exciton energy dependence of the hot-electron relaxation, we show in Fig. 7 a two-dimensional (2D) plot of the electron relaxation dynamics T-MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃(Cl) from the CBM + 4 state. Such 2D phase diagrams, which represent the probability (*z*-axis) of finding the system at a given energy (*y*-axis) at a given time (*x*-axis), offer a good tool for representing and analyzing the dynamics. It is particularly useful in our case since we have

materials with different spacings between the excited states. Note that in plotting this 2D representation, the energy of the ground state configuration is taken as the energy reference. Fig. 7 clearly shows the fast electron relaxation on a timescale of ~ 500 fs for MAPbI₃. This relaxation is followed by a very slow decay that corresponds to a constant population of the conduction band edge state. The lower part of the figure represents the relaxation dynamics of T-MAPbI₃(Cl). As is evident from the figure, a strong slowdown in the relaxation process is seen compared to T-MAPbI₃: the electron relaxation occurs on a timescale of ~ 1500 fs. This shows clearly the effect of mixing with Cl on slowing down the electron relaxation dynamics.

Similarly, Fig. 8 shows the hole relaxation dynamics of $MAPbI_3$ and T-MAPbI₃(Cl), which also shows the positive effects of Cl substitution on the relaxation of the holes. As we already mentioned, holes decay faster than electrons to the band edge, especially in T-MAPbI₃(Cl), leading to a larger concentration of accumulated positive charges at the band edge. Therefore we predict that positive charge accumulation in mixed-halide perovskites is more pronounced than in pure iodide perovskites.

The projected density of states (pDOS) for MAPbI₃, T-MAPbI₃(Cl) and T-MAPbI₃(Br) is shown in Fig. 9, and it explains the origin of the weak couplings in T-MAPbI₃(Cl). At energies close to the VBM, the states of T-MAPbI₃ consist mainly of I(5p) orbitals with an overlapping between Pb(6p) and Pb(6s). At energies close to





Fig. 7 2D map representing the electron relaxation dynamics where the surface hopping (SH) based populations of all basis states (with energy ≤ 0.5 eV below the CBM) as a function of their energy and time for MAPbl₃ (top panel) and T-MAPbl₃(Cl) (bottom panel). Various excited state configurations obtained by promoting an electron from the VBM to the CBM + n (n = 1, 2, ..., 5 for MAPbl₃ and n = 1, 2, ..., 4 for T-MAPbl₃(Cl)) are considered. Here the ground state energy is taken as a reference energy. The dotted line serves as a guide to the eye.

Fig. 8 2D map representing the hole relaxation dynamics where the SH-based populations of all basis states(with energy ≤ 0.5 eV below the VBM) are a function of their energy and time for MAPbI₃ (top panel) and T-MAPbI₃(Cl) (bottom panel). Various excited state configurations obtained by promoting an electron from the VBM – n to the CBM (n = 1, 2, ..., 8 for MAPbI₃ and n = 1, 2, ..., 7 for T-MAPbI₃(Cl)) are considered. Here the ground state energy is taken as a reference energy. The dotted line serves as a guide to the eye.

the CBM, the pDOS is formed by the Pb(6p), I(5p) and I(5s) orbitals. For T-MAPbI₃(Cl), the CB pDOS has a contribution from the Cl(3p) orbitals, and similarly there is a contribution from Br(4p) states in the CB for T-MAPbI₃(Br). As a result, the Pb states at the CBM show notable hybridisation with Cl states, as shown in Fig. 9b. The molecular orbitals for T-MAPbI₃(Cl) are irregular, so there will be more cancellation of the overlaps (negative *vs.* positive) in comparison to T-MAPbI₃ that result in smaller NACs in T-MAPbI₃(Cl) (see Tables S1 and S2, ESI†).

Figure S2 (ESI[†]) shows the influence spectra of electronphonon relaxation from different excited states in three perovskite systems. It is evident from the figure that electrons in MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃(Br) couple more strongly to higher frequency modes than electrons in T-MAPbI₃(Cl). This will lead to a faster electron decay in MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃(Br) compared to MAPbI₃(Cl). For the pDOS of the three perovskite systems shown in Fig. 9, the valence band is dominated by the contribution from the I(5p) states. Therefore, the NACs



Fig. 9 Projected density of states pDOS for (a) $MAPbI_3$ (b) T-MAPbI_3(Cl) and T-MAPbI_3(Br) (c).

between valence states are expected to be similar for doped and undoped systems. A high density of states implies closeness between the energies of VB orbitals. As a result, the interaction of nearly-degenerate orbitals is expected to be large, leading to larger NACs.

The electron localisation function (ELF) is a useful tool to study the electronic structure, especially for chemical bonding states. In Fig. 10, the ELF of MAPbI₃ and T-MAPbI₃(Cl) are plotted and compared. For chlorine substitution, there is a little less overlap between the electronic density of Cl and Pb atoms as compared to the case of the full iodide system. This is mainly due to the asymmetry introduced by out of plane displacement of the Pb atom in MAPbI₃(Cl). We found that Cl doping induces important structural deformation of the PbI6 octahedra removing the inversion symmetry. In pristine MAPbI₃ the octahedra are non-distorted and possess inversion symmetry but only rotate by 17 degrees with respect to their neighbors. However the inversion symmetry is broken in the case of Cl doping at the equatorial site. In T-MAPbI₃(Cl) the rotation of the PbI_6 octahedra reduced to 4 degrees. However, the octahedra are now significantly distorted and asymmetric. The three in plane I-I distances are 4.35 Å except one Cl-I bond is 4.45 Å. In addition, the Pb atom is displaced from the center of the octahedron. Such a displacement can originate from the stronger electronic density localized around Cl. A measurement of the apical Pb-I distance leads to two different bond lengths of 3.37 and 4.1 Å, respectively. The inversion symmetry breaking also lifts the degeneracy of the bands as we observed from band structure analysis.

The NACs are related to the rate of change of orbital overlaps as a result of nuclear motion. Consequently, a large absolute value of the molecular orbital overlaps often leads to larger NACs. As a result, it can be expected that the VB states are coupled to each other more strongly than the CB states. Our findings support this argument, showing VB couplings to be up to an order of magnitude larger than those of the CB (see Tables S1 and S2, ESI[†]).



Fig. 10 Electron localisation function (ELF) contour plots on the basal plane obtained for T-MAPbI₃ (top panel) and T-MAPbI₃(Cl) (bottom panel).

These results explain the faster hole relaxation in comparison to electron relaxation. The present analysis of the pDOS also explains the dependence of hole relaxation dynamics on halide composition.

Recently, Xing *et al.* reported that hot holes created at an energy ~1 eV below the VBM relax to the band edge of the valence band within ~400 fs.¹⁵ Using time-resolved transient absorption studies, Piatkowski *et al.*⁸³ observed that hot electron and hot hole relaxation times within perovskite conduction and valence bands are 700 and 600 fs, respectively. Our data in Fig. 11 indicate that hot hole (with energy ≤ 1.0 eV below the VBM) relaxation near the band edge of the valence band is characterized by a relaxation time of about 700 fs which is in good agreement with the experimental value reported in ref. 83.

Pure as well as mixed-halide perovskites have been successfully used in solar cell devices and showed high efficiency, but on the other hand the incorporation mechanism of chlorine into the pure iodide perovskite and its effect are still a matter of debate. Dharani et al.,34 showed that the addition of low amounts of Cl leads to an increase in the perovskite conductivity and therefore improves the solar cell performance. Wehrenfennig et al.²⁵ attributed the improved performance of MAPbI_{3-x}Cl_x mixed-halide perovskites compared to that of MAPbI₃ to lower charge recombination rates rather than to better charge mobility. Our present work suggests that doping with low amounts of Cl has a strong impact on slowing down the electron and hole relaxation dynamics. As a consequence, the life time of initially generated exciton is increased, leading to better chances of charge separation. In addition, the asymmetry in electron and hole relaxation dynamics may also contribute to lowering of electron-hole recombination rates.

2.4 Spectral density

To gain insight into the type of vibronic modes that drive the non-radiative energy relaxation in perovskites, we have computed the influence spectrum for all considered systems. The computations are based on the optical response formalism,



Fig. 11 2D map representing the hot hole relaxation dynamics where the SH-based populations of all basis states (with energy ≤ 1.0 eV below the VBM) are a function of their energy and time for MAPbI₃. The first 18 excited state configurations obtained by promoting an electron from the VBM - n to the CBM are considered. The energy of the ground state configuration is taken as reference energy.

as detailed elsewhere.^{74,84-86} The influence spectra are similar to IR or phonon DOS spectra, except that they show only the modes responsible for each particular electronic transition. The computed influence spectra of the pure iodide perovskite are shown in Fig. 12a and b for electron and hole relaxations, respectively. The influence spectrum is calculated by taking the Fourier transform of the time-dependent energy gap autocorrelation function for a pair of electronic/hole states. For the electron influence spectrum, an intense peak is seen around 85 cm⁻¹. Other less pronounced peaks in the frequency range between 200 and 600 cm^{-1} are also present, especially for MAPbI₃. The amplitude of the peaks in the influence spectrum corresponds to the electron-phonon (hole-phonon) coupling strength at that frequency. The influence spectrum for hole relaxation shows similar frequencies. The nature of the vibration modes in perovskite materials has already been investigated in several recent publications as we discuss in the following.

In ref. 87, it was reported that the high-frequency modes are associated with vibrational modes of the molecular cation. The lowest frequency modes (below 150 cm⁻¹) arise mainly from the inorganic cage, but with half of the modes coupled to the motion of the MA molecule. Quarti *et al.*⁸⁸ reported experimentally measured Raman spectra, and they calculated the spectra for various structural phases of T-MAPbI₃ and identified the origin of the most important frequencies.

Fig. 12a illustrates the influence spectra for electron relaxation, which is dominated by contributions from modes around 100 cm^{-1} and attributed to the inorganic cage modes. Contributions from high frequency modes are also present at frequencies between 200 and 600 cm⁻¹. As mentioned before, these high-frequency modes are attributed to the motion of the



Fig. 12 Influence spectra of the electron–phonon (a) and hole–phonon (b) relaxation from different excited states in MAPbI₃.

PCCP

MA molecules and to coupled modes between the organic and inorganic parts. Fig. 12b shows that the influence spectra for hole relaxation are not dominated only by contributions from a mode around 100 cm^{-1} , as the case of electron relaxation, but also contain contributions from higher frequency modes. A dominant one of these additional modes has a frequency near 150 cm⁻¹, which corresponds to Pb-I bond stretching and MA twisting (a collective motion). The MA molecular vibration and motion are widely accepted to play a crucial role in the electronic properties of T-MAPbI₃.^{89,90} For example, Motta et al.90 demonstrated that the MA full rotation induced by temperature fluctuations could affect the VBM and CBM edges even prohibiting carrier recombination. The T-MAPbI₃ behaves as a direct band gap semiconductor while the molecular motion prohibits the radiative recombination, thus contributing to the accumulation of charge at the band edges. Zheng et al.63 identified the phonon modes that contribute most to the carrier relaxation. These modes were attributed mainly to the MA molecule, such as MA translation, CH/NH bond twisting and CH/NH stretching. Our simulations indicate an important role of the MA molecule in the carrier relaxation dynamics.

3 Conclusions

In conclusion, motivated by recent experimental studies on carrier transport and thermalization, we have investigated hot carrier relaxation dynamics in mixed-halide perovskites using first-principles methods. We have identified the ultrafast charge carrier cooling process and determined the relaxation time for both electrons and holes for a wide range of excitation energies. For the lead iodide perovskite, our results show that electrons excited up to 0.5 eV above the CBM and holes created up to 1.0 eV below the VBM relax within \sim 700 fs, in agreement with recent experimental results. Hole relaxation is found to be faster than electron relaxation and this difference is more pronounced for the Cl doped material. Based on the results of our calculations, we attribute this difference to larger NA couplings between valence band states compared to those between conduction band states. This asymmetry in electron and hole relaxation dynamics may also contribute to lowering electron-hole recombination rates. We also found that halide mixing with Cl at low concentrations leads to a slowing down of the electron and hole relaxation dynamics. This is due to the reduced NAC in the system originating from the charge state localization around the Cl atom. Our analysis of the spectral density shows that electron and hole relaxation is driven mainly by low-frequency modes related to I and Pb ion motions. There is also a contribution from high frequency modes related to MA ion motion and to coupled modes between organic and inorganic parts. We showed that slowing down the hot carrier thermalization dynamics can be realized by considering simple methods based on chloride doped perovskite materials. These results will help guide future work on how the phonon modes in different materials can affect hot carrier relaxation.

View Article Online

Paper

We thank S. Hoogland and O. Voznyy for their careful reading of the manuscript and helpful comments. Computational resources have been provided by the research computing center at Texas A&M University in Qatar. A. V. A. acknowledges the financial support from the University at Buffalo, The State University of New York startup package.

References

- G. Xing, N. Mathews, S. S. Lim, N. Yantara, X. Liu, D. Sabba, M. Grätzel, S. Mhaisalkar and T. C. Sum, *Nat. Mater.*, 2014, 13, 476.
- 2 National Renewable Energy Laboratory, Best Research-Cell Efficiencies, www.nrel.gov/ncpv/images/efficiency_chart.jpg.
- 3 M. A. Green, A. Ho-Baillie and H. J. Snaith, *Nat. Photonics*, 2014, **8**, 506.
- 4 J. Gong, S. B. Darling and F. You, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015, **8**, 1953.
- 5 T. C. Sum and N. Mathews, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2014, 7, 2518.
- 6 P. Gao, M. Grätzel and M. K. Nazeeruddin, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2014, 7, 2448.
- 7 H. Zhou, Q. Chen, G. Li, S. Luo, T.-b. Song, H.-S. Duan, Z. Hong, J. You, Y. Liu and Y. Yang, *Science*, 2014, 345, 542.
- 8 S. A. Bretschneider, J. Weickert, J. A. Dorman and L. Schmidt-Mende, *APL Mater.*, 2014, **2**, 040701.
- 9 J. H. Heo, H. J. Han, D. Kim, T. K. Ahn and S. H. Im, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015, **8**, 1602.
- 10 I. E. Castelli, K. S. Thygesen and K. W. Jacobsen, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015, **3**, 12343.
- 11 P. Umari, E. Mosconi and F. De Angelis, *Sci. Rep.*, 2014, 4, 4467.
- 12 J. M. Frost, K. T. Butler, F. Brivio, C. H. Hendon and M. van Schilfgaarde, *Nano Lett.*, 2014, 14, 2584.
- 13 J. M. Frost, K. T. Butler, A. Walsh and M. van Schilfgaarde, *Phys. Rev. B: Condens. Matter Mater. Phys.*, 2014, 89, 155204.
- 14 W. J. Yin, T. Shi and Y. Yan, Adv. Mater., 2014, 26, 4653.
- 15 G. Xing, N. Mathews, S. Sun, S. S. Lim, Y. M. Lam, M. Grätzel, S. Mhaisalkar and T. C. Sum, *Science*, 2013, 342, 344.
- 16 S. D. Stranks, G. E. Eperon, G. Grancini, C. Menelaou, M. J. Alcocer, T. Leijtens, L. M. Herz, A. Petrozza and H. J. Snaith, *Science*, 2013, 342, 341.
- 17 Q. Dong, Y. Fang, Y. Shao, P. Mulligan, J. Qiu, L. Cao and J. Huang, *Science*, 2015, 347, 967.
- 18 Y. X. Zhao, A. M. Nardes and K. Zhu, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2014, 5, 490.
- D. Shi, V. Adinolfi, R. Comin, M. Yuan, E. Alarousu, A. Buin,
 Y. Chen, S. Hoogland, A. Rothenberger, K. Katsiev,
 Y. Losovyj, X. Zhang, P. A. Dowben, O. F. Mohammed,
 E. H. Sargent and O. M. Bakr, *Science*, 2015, 347, 519.
- 20 F. Brivio, A. B. Walker and A. Walsh, *APL Mater.*, 2013, 1, 042111.

- 21 G. Giorgi, J.-I. Fujisawa, H. Segawa and K. Yamashita, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2013, 4, 4212.
- 22 Y. X. Zhao and K. Zhu, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2013, 4, 2880.
- 23 J. Feng and B. Xiao, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2014, 5, 1278.
- 24 M. H. Du, J. Mater. Chem., 2013, 4, 4213.
- 25 C. Wehrenfennig, G. E. Eperon, M. B. Johnston, H. J. Snaith and L. M. Herz, *Adv. Mater.*, 2014, **26**, 1584.
- 26 W. J. Yin, T. Shi and Y. Yan, *Appl. Phys. Lett.*, 2014, **104**, 063903.
- 27 J. Kim, S. H. Lee, J. H. Lee and H. K. Hong, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2014, 5, 1312.
- 28 S. Colella, E. Mosconi, P. Fedeli, A. Listorti, F. Gazza, F. Orlandi, P. Ferro, T. Besagni, A. Rizzo, G. Calestani, G. Gigli, F. De Angelis and R. Mosca, *Chem. Mater.*, 2013, 25, 4613.
- 29 E. Mosconi, A. Amat, Md. K. Nazeeruddin, M. Grätzel and F. De Angelis, *J. Phys. Chem. C*, 2013, **117**, 13902.
- 30 J. H. Noh, S. H. Im, J. Heo, T. N. Mandal and S. I. Seok, *Nano Lett.*, 2014, 13, 1764.
- 31 A. Amat, E. Mosconi, E. Ronca, C. Quarti, P. Umari, M. K. Nazeeruddin, M. Graetzel and F. De Angelis, *Nano Lett.*, 2014, 14, 3608.
- 32 W.-J. Yin, Y. Yan and S.-H. Wei, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2014, 5, 3625.
- 33 M. Zhang, H. Yu, M. Lyu, Q. Wang, J.-H. Yun and L. Wang, *Chem. Commun.*, 2014, **50**, 11727.
- 34 S. Dharani, H. A. Dewi, R. R. Prabhakar, T. Baikie, C. Shi, D. Yonghua, N. Mathews, P. P. Boix and S. G. Mhaisalkar, *Nanoscale*, 2014, 6, 13854.
- 35 S. T. Williams, F. Zuo, C.-C. Chueh, C.-Y. Liao, P.-W. Liang and A. K.-Y. Jen, *ACS Nano*, 2014, **8**, 10640.
- 36 E. T. Hoke, D. J. Slotcavage, E. R. Dohner, A. R. Bowring,
 H. I. Karunadasa and M. D. McGehee, *Chem. Sci.*, 2015,
 6, 613.
- 37 N. J. Jeon, J. H. Noh, W. S. Yang, Y. C. Kim, S. Ryu, J. Seo and S. Seok, *Nature*, 2015, **517**, 476.
- 38 W. Nie, H. Tsai, R. Asadpour, J.-C. Blancon, A. J. Neukirch, G. Gupta, J. J. Crochet, M. Chhowalla, S. Tretiak, M. A. Alam, H.-L. Wang and A. D. Mohite, *Science*, 2015, 347, 522.
- 39 M. M. Lee, J. Teuscher, T. Miyasaka, T. N. Murakami and H. J. Snaith, *Science*, 2012, **338**, 643.
- 40 A. Buin, P. Pietsch, J. Xu, O. Voznyy, A. H. Ip, R. Comin and E. H. Sargent, *Nano Lett.*, 2014, 14, 6281.
- 41 E. Edri, S. Kirmayer, M. Kulbak, G. Hodes and D. Cahen, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2014, 5, 429.
- 42 E. Edri, S. Kirmayer, A. Henning, S. Mukhopadhyay,
 K. Gartsman, Y. Rosenwaks, G. Hodes and D. Cahen, *Nano Lett.*, 2014, 14, 1000.
- 43 F. Zheng, H. Takenaka, F. Wang, N. Z. Koocher and A. M. Rappe, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2015, **6**, 31.
- 44 T. J. Savenije, C. S. Ponseca, Jr., L. Kunneman, M. Abdellah,
 K. Zheng, Y. Tian, Q. Zhu, S. E. Canton, I. G. Scheblykin,
 T. Pullerits, A. Yartsev and V. Sundstrom, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2014, 5, 2189.
- 45 C. Wehrenfennig, M. Liu, H. J. Snaith, M. B. Johnston and L. M. Herz, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2014, **5**, 1300.

- 46 C. Wehrenfennig, M. Liu, H. J. Snaith, M. B. Johnston and L. M. Herz, APL Mater., 2014, 2, 081513.
- 47 J. M. Ball, S. D. Stranks, M. T. Hörantner, S. Hüttner, W. Zhang, E. J. W. Crossland, I. Ramirez, M. Riede, M. B. Johnston, R. H. Friend and H. J. Snaith, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015, 8, 602.
- 48 J. M. Azpiroz, E. Mosconi, J. Bisquert and F. De Angelis, Energy Environ. Sci., 2015, 8, 2118.
- 49 C. X. Sheng, C. Zhang, Y. Zhai, K. Mielczarek, W. Wang, W. Ma, A. Zakhidov and Z. V. Vardeny, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2015, 114, 116601.
- 50 A. Miyata, A. Mitioglu, P. Plochocka, O. Portugall, J. T. Wang, S. D. Stranks, H. J. Snaith and R. J. Nicholas, *Nat. Phys.*, 2015, **11**, 582.
- 51 H. Hsu, C. Wang, A. Fathi, J. Shiu, C. Chung, P. Shen, T. Guo, P. Chen, Y. Lee and E. Diau, *Angew. Chem.*, 2014, 53, 1.
- 52 R. T. Ross and A. J. Nozik, J. Appl. Phys., 1982, 53, 3818.
- 53 G. Conibeer, R. Patterson, L. Huang, J. F. Guillemoles, D. König, S. Shrestha and M. A. Green, *Sol. Energy Mater. Sol. Cells*, 2010, 94, 1516.
- 54 S. Saeed, E. M. L. D. de Jong, K. Dohnalova and T. Gregorkiewicz, *Nat. Commun.*, 2014, 5, 4665.
- 55 Y. Yang, D. P. Ostrowski, R. M. France, K. Zhu, J. van de Lagemaat, J. M. Luther and M. C. Beard, *Nat. Photonics*, 2015, **10**, 53.
- 56 M. B. Price, J. Butkus, T. C. Jellicoe, A. Sadhanala, A. Briane, J. E. Halpert, K. Broch, J. M. Hodgkiss, R. H. Friend and F. Deschler, *Nat. Commun.*, 2015, 6, 8420.
- 57 A. Marchioro, J. Teuscher, D. Friedrich, M. Kunst, R. van de Krol, T. Moehl, M. Grätzel and J.-E. Moser, *Nat. Photonics*, 2014, 8, 250.
- 58 C. Wehrenfennig, M. Liu, H. J. Snaith, M. B. Johnston and L. M. Herz, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2014, 7, 2269.
- 59 H. Kawai, G. Giorgi, A. Marini and K. Yamashita, *Nano Lett.*, 2015, **15**, 3103.
- 60 J. A. Christians, J. S. Manser and P. V. Kamat, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2015, 6, 2086.
- 61 M. T. Trinh, X. Wu, D. Niesner and X.-Y. Zhu, J. Mater. Chem. A, 2015, 3, 9285.
- 62 R. Nanguneri and J. Parkhill, 2014, arXiv:1411.1110.
- 63 F. Zheng, L. Z. Tan, S. Liu and A. M. Rappe, *Nano Lett.*, 2015, 15, 7794.
- 64 K. Chen, A. J. Barker, F. L. C. Morgan, J. E. Halpert and J. M. Hodgkiss, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2015, 6, 153.
- 65 K. G. Stamplecoskie, J. S. Manserab and P. V. Kamat, *Energy Environ. Sci.*, 2015, **8**, 208.
- 66 J. S. Manser and P. V. Kamat, Nat. Photonics, 2014, 8, 737.
- 67 P. Umari, E. Mosconi and F. De Angelis, *Sci. Rep.*, 2013, 4, 4467.
- 68 J. C. Tully, J. Chem. Phys., 1990, 93, 1061.
- 69 L. Verlet, Phys. Rev., 1967, 159, 98.
- 70 W. C. Swope, H. C. Andersen, P. H. Berens and K. R. Wilson, J. Chem. Phys., 1982, 76, 637.
- 71 S. Hammes-Schiffer and J. C. Tully, *J. Chem. Phys.*, 1994, **101**, 4657.

- 72 X. Zhang, Z. Li and G. Lu, Phys. Rev. B: Condens. Matter Mater. Phys., 2010, 82, 205210.
- 73 A. V. Akimov and O. V. Prezhdo, *J. Chem. Theory Comput.*, 2014, **10**, 789.
- 74 A. V. Akimov and O. V. Prezhdo, J. Chem. Theory Comput., 2013, 9, 4959.
- 75 A. V. Akimov, A. J. Neukirch and O. V. Prezhdo, *Chem. Rev.*, 2013, **113**, 4497.
- 76 J. P. Perdew, K. Burke and M. Ernzerhof, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 1996, 77, 3865.
- 77 J. P. Perdew, K. Burke and M. Ernzerhof, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 1997, 78, 1396.
- 78 P. Gianozzi, S. Baroni, N. Bonini, M. Calandra, R. Car, C. Cavazzoni, D. Ceresoli, G. L. Chiarotti, M. Cococcioni, I. Dabo, A. Dal Corso, S. de Gironcoli, S. Fabris, G. Fratesi, R. Gebauer, U. Gerstmann, C. Gougoussis, A. Kokalj, M. Lazzeri, L. Martin-Samos, N. Marzari, F. Mauri, R. Mazzarello, S. Paolini, A. Pasquarello, L. Paulatto, C. Sbraccia, S. Scandolo, G. Sclauzero, A. P. Seitsonen, A. Smogunov, P. Umari and R. M. Wentzcovitch, QUANTUM ESPRESSO: A Modular and Open-Source Software Project for Quantum Simulations of Materials, *J. Phys.: Condens. Matter*, 2009, 21, 395592.
- 79 H. C. Andersen, J. Chem. Phys., 1980, 72, 2384.

- 80 C. Craig, W. Duncan and O. Prezhdo, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2005, 95, 163001.
- 81 M. Bernardi, D. Vigil-Fowler, J. Lischner, J. B. Neaton and S. G. Louie, *Phys. Rev. Lett.*, 2014, **112**, 257402.
- 82 E. Mosconi, A. Amat, Md. K. Nazeeruddin, M. Grätzel and F. De Angelis, J. Phys. Chem. C, 2013, 117, 13902.
- 83 P. Piatkowski, B. Cohen, F. J. Ramos, M. Di Nunzio, M. K. Nazeeruddin, M. Grätzel, S. Ahmad and A. Douhal, *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2015, **17**, 14674.
- 84 S. Mukamel, Principles of Nonlinear Optical Spectroscopy, Oxford University Press, New York, 1995.
- 85 A. B. Madrid, K. Hyeon-Deuk, B. F. Habenicht and O. V. Prezhdo, *ACS Nano*, 2009, **3**, 2487.
- 86 A. V. Akimov and O. V. Prezhdo, J. Phys. Chem. Lett., 2013, 4, 3857.
- 87 F. Brivio, J. M. Frost, J. M. Skelton, A. J. Jackson, O. J. Weber, M. T. Weller, A. R. Goni, A. M. A. Leguy, P. R. F. Barnes and A. Walsh, *Phys. Rev. B*, 2015, **92**, 144308.
- 88 C. Quarti, G. Grancini, E. Mosconi, P. Bruno, J. M. Ball, M. M. Lee, H. J. Snaith, A. Petrozza and F. De Angelis, *J. Phys. Chem. Lett.*, 2014, 5, 279.
- 89 M. A. Carignano, A. Kachmar and J. Hutter, *J. Phys. Chem. C*, 2015, **119**, 8991.
- 90 C. Motta, F. El-Mellouhi, S. Kais, N. Tabet, F. Alharbi and S. Sanvito, *Nat. Commun.*, 2015, 6, 7026.